

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

JAVIER MONGE,
Plaintiff,
vs.

CORD MEYER DEVELOPMENT LLC,
BEN'S KOSHER DELICATESSEN &
RESTAURANT INC. and DOHERTY
BREADS NYC, LLC,
Defendants.

COMPLAINT

Plaintiff, JAVIER MONGE (“Plaintiff”), by his undersigned counsel, hereby files this Complaint against Defendants, CORD MEYER DEVELOPMENT LLC, BEN'S KOSHER DELICATESSEN & RESTAURANT INC. and DOHERTY BREADS NYC, LLC (the “Defendants”) for injunctive relief pursuant to the Americans with Disabilities Act, 42 U.S.C. § 12181, et seq., (the ADA) and the ADA’s Accessibility Guidelines, 28 C.F.R. Part 36 (hereinafter the “ADAAG”). This matter concerns Plaintiff’s visits to a restaurant located at 211-37 26th Ave, Queens, NY 11360 and/or 23-58 Bell Blvd, Queens, NY 11360, BEN’S KOSHER DELICATESSEN and PANERA BREAD, wherein Plaintiff encountered several barriers which have and will deter him from visiting the restaurant in the future. Plaintiff’s past visit and his desire to return are fully set forth herein.

JURISDICTION

1. This Court has original jurisdiction over the action pursuant to 28 U.S.C., §§1331 and 1343 for Plaintiff’s claims arising under 42 U.S.C. § 12181. et seq., based upon Defendants’ violations of Title III of the ADA (see also, 28 U.S.C. §§ 2201 and 2202).

2. Plaintiff currently resides in the Bronx, New York.

3. Plaintiff suffers from cerebral palsy, must ambulate in a wheelchair, **has difficulty pinching and grasping with his hands**, and is a qualified individual with disabilities under the ADA.

4. Plaintiff visited the subject property located at 211-37 26th Ave, Queens, NY 11360 (the “Facility”) to enjoy the goods and services offered therein and encountered barriers to access. Plaintiff desires and intends to return to the Facility to enjoy to goods and services offered therein. However, his access to the Facility continues to be denied and/or substantially limited. His access will continue to be denied until Defendants removes the barriers, including those set forth in the Complaint at Paragraph 16 below.

5. Defendant, CORD MEYER DEVELOPMENT LLC, transacts business in the State of New York and within this judicial district. Defendant, CORD MEYER DEVELOPMENT LLC, is the owner and/or lessor, of the real property located at 211-37 26th Ave, Queens, NY 11360 and/or 23-58 Bell Blvd, Queens, NY 11360 where the restaurants known as BEN’S KOSHER DELICATESSEN and PANERA BREAD are located (the “Facilities”).

6. Defendant, BEN'S KOSHER DELICATESSEN & RESTAURANT INC., transacts business in the State of New York and within this judicial district. Defendant, BEN'S KOSHER DELICATESSEN & RESTAURANT INC.is the lessee of the Facility located at 211-37 26th Ave, Queens, NY 11360 and the owner and/or operator of a restaurant known as BEN’S KOSHER DELICATESSEN (the “Facility”).

7. Defendant, DOHERTY BREADS NYC, LLC, transacts business in the State of New York and within this judicial district. Defendant, DOHERTY BREADS NYC, LLC is the

lessee of the Facility located at 23-58 Bell Blvd, Queens, NY 11360 and the owner and/or operator of a restaurant known as PANERA BREAD (the “Facility”).

8. The Facility is a place of public accommodation under the ADA.

9. Plaintiff has suffered legal harm and injury in fact, as he visited the Facility to enjoy the goods and services provided therein, encountered barriers to access, and desires and intends to re-visit the Facility again, but is unable to do so until the barriers to access are remediated.

10. The barriers alleged in Paragraph 15, by their very nature, prevent Plaintiff and other wheelchair bound patrons from accessing the premises and enjoying the goods and services offered therein.

11. The removal of the alleged barriers can be accomplished without much difficulty or expense.

12. All events giving rise to this lawsuit occurred in the State of New York. Venue is proper in this Court as the premises is in the Southern District.

FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS AND CLAIM

13. Plaintiff has attempted to access the Facility to enjoy the goods and services offered therein but could not do so without substantial hardship due to his disability, which requires him to ambulate in a wheelchair, and the significant barriers to access existing at the Facility.

14. Plaintiff intends to visit the Facility in the future to enjoy to goods and services offered therein. However, his access to the Facility continues to be denied and/or substantially limited. His access will continue to be denied until Defendants remove the barriers, including those set forth in the Complaint at Paragraph 16 below.

15. Defendants have discriminated against Plaintiff by denying him full access to the goods, services and/or accommodations of the Facility, as prohibited by 42 U.S.C., § 12182, et. seq., and by failing to remove architectural barriers as required by 42 U.S.C., § 12182(b)(2)(A)(iv), will continue to discriminate against Plaintiff unless and until Defendants remove all physical barriers including those specifically set forth below.

16. Defendants have discriminated against Plaintiff by failing to remedy the ADA violations, which by their nature, affect Plaintiff and other wheelchair bound plaintiffs. A specific list of ADA violations which preclude and/or limit Plaintiff's ability to access the facility and to enjoy the goods and services offered therein, include the following:

BEN'S KOSHER DELICATESSEN:

1. Inaccessible dining tables.
2. Required minimum knee and toe clearance not provided at dining tables.
3. A minimum percentage of existing dining tables required to be accessible not provided.

ADAAG 226 Dining Surfaces and Work Surfaces ADAAG 226.1 General.

Where dining surfaces are provided for the consumption of food or drink, at least 5 percent of the seating spaces and standing spaces at the dining surfaces shall comply with 902.

ADAAG 902 Dining Surfaces and Work Surfaces ADAAG 902.1 General.

Dining surfaces and work surfaces shall comply with 902.2 and 902.3.

ADAAG 902.2 Clear Floor or Ground Space.

A clear floor space complying with 305 positioned for a forward approach shall be provided. Knee and toe clearance complying with 306 shall be provided.

ADAAG 306.2 Toe Clearance.

ADAAG 306.2.3 Minimum Required Depth.

Where toe clearance is required at an element as part of a clear floor space, the toe clearance shall extend 17 inches (430 mm) minimum under the element.

ADAAG 306.2.5 Width.

Toe clearance shall be 30 inches (760 mm) wide minimum.

ADAAG 306.3 Knee Clearance.

ADAAG 306.3.3 Minimum Required Depth.

Where knee clearance is required under an element as part of a clear floor space, the knee clearance shall be 11 inches deep minimum at 9 inches above

the ground, and 8 inches deep minimum at 27 inches (685 mm) above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 306.3.5 Width.

Knee clearance shall be 30 inches (760 mm) wide minimum.

4. Inaccessible dining booth tables.
5. Required minimum clear floor space not provided at dining booth tables.
6. A minimum percentage of existing dining booth tables required to be accessible not provided.

ADAAG 226 Dining Surfaces and Work Surfaces ADAAG 226.1 General.

Where dining surfaces are provided for the consumption of food or drink, at least 5 percent of the seating spaces and standing spaces at the dining surfaces shall comply with 902.

ADAAG 902 Dining Surfaces and Work Surfaces ADAAG 902.1 General.

Dining surfaces and work surfaces shall comply with 902.2 and 902.3.

ADAAG 902.2 Clear Floor or Ground Space.

A clear floor space complying with 305 positioned for a forward approach shall be provided. Knee and toe clearance complying with 306 shall be provided.

ADAAG 305.3 Size.

The clear floor or ground space shall be 30 inches (760 mm) minimum by 48 inches (1220 mm) minimum.

7. Non-compliant location of signage identifying the men's restroom.

ADAAG 216 Signs ADAAG 216.1 General.

Signs shall be provided in accordance with 216 and shall comply with 703.

ADAAG 216.2 Designations.

Interior and exterior signs identifying permanent rooms and spaces shall comply with 703.1, 703.2, and 703.5. Where pictograms are provided as designations of permanent interior rooms and spaces, the pictograms shall comply with 703.6 and shall have text descriptors complying with 703.2 and 703.5.

Advisory 216.2 Designations.

Section 216.2 applies to signs that provide designations, labels, or names for interior rooms or spaces where the sign is not likely to change over time. Examples include interior signs labeling restrooms, room and floor numbers or letters, and room names. Tactile text descriptors are required for pictograms that are provided to label or identify a permanent room or space.

Pictograms that provide information about a room or space, such as “no smoking,” occupant logos, and the International Symbol of Accessibility, are not required to have text descriptors.

ADAAG 703.1 General.

Signs shall comply with 703. Where both visual and tactile characters are required, either one sign with both visual and tactile characters, or two separate signs, one with visual, and one with tactile characters, shall be provided.

ADAAG 703.4.2 Location.

Where a tactile sign is provided at a door, the sign shall be located alongside the door at the latch side. Where a tactile sign is provided at double doors with one active leaf, the sign shall be located on the inactive leaf. Where a tactile sign is provided at double doors with two active leaves, the sign shall be located to the right of the right hand door. Where there is no wall space at the latch side of a single door or at the right side of double doors, signs shall be located on the nearest adjacent wall. Signs containing tactile characters shall be located so that a clear floor space of 18 inches (455 mm) minimum by 18 inches (455 mm) minimum, centered on the tactile characters, is provided beyond the arc of any door swing between the closed position and 45 degree open position.

8. Inaccessible lavatory in men's restroom.
9. Required minimum knee and toe clearance not provided at lavatory in men's restroom.

ADAAG 606 Lavatories and Sinks.

ADAAG 606.2 Clear Floor Space.

A clear floor space complying with 305, positioned for a forward approach, and knee and toe clearance complying with 306 shall be provided.

ADAAG 306.2 Toe Clearance.

ADAAG 306.2.3 Minimum Required Depth.

Where toe clearance is required at an element as part of a clear floor space, the toe clearance shall extend 17 inches (430 mm) minimum under the element.

ADAAG 306.2.5 Width.

Toe clearance shall be 30 inches (760 mm) wide minimum.

ADAAG 306.3 Knee Clearance.

ADAAG 306.3.3 Minimum Required Depth.

Where knee clearance is required under an element as part of a clear floor space, the knee clearance shall be 11 inches deep minimum at 9 inches above the ground, and 8 inches deep minimum at 27 inches (685 mm) above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 306.3.5 Width.

Knee clearance shall be 30 inches (760 mm) wide minimum.

10. Non-compliant height of lavatory in men's restroom exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 606 Lavatories and Sinks.

ADAAG 606.1 General.

Lavatories and sinks shall comply with 606.

ADAAG 606.3 Height.

Lavatories and sinks shall be installed with the front of the higher of the rim or counter surface 34 inches (865 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground.

11. Insulation of pipes and water lines under the lavatory in men's restroom not provided as required.

ADAAG 606 Lavatories and Sinks.

ADAAG 606.5 Exposed Pipes and Surfaces.

Water supply and drain pipes under lavatories and sinks shall be insulated or otherwise configured to protect against contact. There shall be no sharp or abrasive surfaces under lavatories and sinks.

12. Inaccessible paper towel dispenser in men's restroom.

13. Non-compliant mounted height of paper towel dispenser in men's restroom exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG Advisory 606.1 General.

If soap and towel dispensers are provided, they must be located within the reach ranges specified In 308. Locate soap and towel dispensers so that they are conveniently usable by a person at the accessible lavatory.

ADAAG 308.2 Forward Reach. ADAAG 308.2.1 Unobstructed.

Where a forward reach is unobstructed, the high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low forward reach shall be 15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.2.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a high forward reach is over an obstruction, the clear floor space shall extend beneath the element for a distance not less than the required reach depth over the obstruction. The high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum where the reach depth is 20 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 20 inches, the high forward reach shall be 44 inches maximum and the reach depth shall be 25 inches maximum.

ADAAG 308.3 Side Reach. ADAAG 308.3.1 Unobstructed.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the side reach is unobstructed, the high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low side reach shall be

15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.3.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the high side reach is over an obstruction, the height of the obstruction shall be 34 inches maximum and the depth of the obstruction shall be 24 inches maximum. The high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum for a reach depth of 10 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 10 inches, the high side reach shall be 46 inches maximum for a reach depth of 24 inches maximum.

14. Inaccessible urinal in men's restroom.

15. Non-compliant height of wall mounted urinal in men's restroom exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 605 Urinals

ADAAG 605.1 General.

Urinals shall comply with 605.

ADAAG 605.2 Height and Depth.

Urinals shall be the stall-type or the wall-hung type with the rim 17 inches (430 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground. Urinals shall be 13½ inches (345 mm) deep minimum measured from the outer face of the urinal rim to the back of the fixture

16. Inaccessible door lock at door of toilet compartment in men's restroom.

17. Non-compliant height of door lock at door of toilet compartment in men's restroom exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

ADAAG 604.8 Toilet Compartments.

Wheelchair accessible toilet compartments shall meet the requirements of 604.8.1 and 604.8.3. Compartments containing more than one plumbing fixture shall comply with 603.

Ambulatory accessible compartments shall comply with 604.8.2 and 604.8.3.

ADAAG 604.8.1.2 Doors.

Toilet compartment doors, including door hardware, shall comply with 404 except that if the approach is to the latch side of the compartment door, clearance between the door side of the compartment and any obstruction shall be 42 inches (1065 mm) minimum.

Doors shall be located in the front partition or in the side wall or partition farthest from the water closet. Where located in the front partition, the door opening shall be 4 inches (100 mm) maximum from the side wall or partition farthest from the water closet. Where located in the side wall or partition, the door opening shall be 4 inches (100 mm) maximum from the front partition. The door shall be self-closing. A door pull complying with 404.2.7 shall be placed on both sides of the door near the latch.

Toilet compartment doors shall not swing into the minimum required compartment area.

ADAAG 404 Doors, Doorways, and Gates ADAAG 404.1 General.

Doors, doorways, and gates that are part of an accessible route shall comply with 404.

ADAAG 404.2.7 Door and Gate Hardware.

Handles, pulls, latches, locks, and other operable parts on doors and gates shall comply with 309.4. Operable parts of such hardware shall be 34 inches (865 mm) minimum and 48 inches (1220 mm) maximum above the finish floor or ground.

18. Non-compliant existing grab bar at rear wall of water closet in toilet compartment in men's restroom does not meet minimum size requirement.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments

ADAAG 604.5.2 Rear Wall.

The rear wall grab bar shall be 36 inches (915 mm) long minimum and extend from the centerline of the water closet 12 inches (305 mm) minimum on one

side and 24 inches (610 mm) minimum on the other side.

19. Inaccessible coat hook in toilet compartment in men's restroom.
20. Non-compliant height of coat hook in toilet compartment in men's restroom exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

ADAAG 604.8.3 Coat Hooks and Shelves.

Coat hooks shall be located within one of the reach ranges specified in 308.

ADAAG 308.2 Forward Reach. ADAAG 308.2.1 Unobstructed.

Where a forward reach is unobstructed, the high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low forward reach shall be 15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.2.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a high forward reach is over an obstruction, the clear floor space shall extend beneath the element for a distance not less than the required reach depth over the obstruction. The high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum where the reach depth is 20 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 20 inches, the high forward reach shall be 44 inches maximum and the reach depth shall be 25 inches maximum.

ADAAG 308.3 Side Reach. ADAAG 308.3.1 Unobstructed.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the side reach is unobstructed, the high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low side reach shall be

15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.3.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the high side reach is over an obstruction, the height of the obstruction shall be 34 inches maximum and the depth of the obstruction shall be 24 inches maximum. The high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum for a reach depth of 10 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 10 inches, the high side reach shall be 46 inches maximum for a reach depth of 24 inches maximum.

PANERA BREAD:

1. Inaccessible pick-up service counter.
2. Non-compliant height of pick-up service counter exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 227 Sales and Service ADAAG 227.1 General.

Where provided, check-out aisles, sales counters, service counters, food service lines, queues, and waiting lines shall comply with 227 and 904.

ADAAG 904.4 Sales and Service Counters.

Sales counters and service counters shall comply with 904.4.1 or 904.4.2.

The accessible portion of the counter top shall extend the same depth as the sales or service counter top.

ADAAG 904.4.1 Parallel Approach.

A portion of the counter surface that is 36 inches (915 mm) long minimum and 36 inches (915 mm) high maximum above the finish floor shall be provided.

A clear floor or ground space complying with 305 shall be positioned for a parallel approach adjacent to the 36 inch (915 mm) minimum length of counter.

3. Inaccessible self service beverage dispenser.
4. Non-compliant height of self service beverage dispenser exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 904.5.1 Self-Service Shelves and Dispensing Devices.

Self-service shelves and dispensing devices for tableware, dishware, condiments, food and beverages shall comply with 308.

ADAAG 308.2 Forward Reach. ADAAG 308.2.1 Unobstructed.

Where a forward reach is unobstructed, the high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low forward reach shall be 15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.2.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a high forward reach is over an obstruction, the clear floor space shall extend beneath the element for a distance not less than the required reach depth over the obstruction. The high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum where the reach depth is 20 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 20 inches, the high forward reach shall be 44 inches maximum and the reach depth shall be 25 inches maximum.

ADAAG 308.3 Side Reach. ADAAG 308.3.1 Unobstructed.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the side reach is unobstructed, the high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low side reach shall be

15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.3.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the high side reach is over an obstruction, the height of the obstruction shall be 34 inches maximum and the depth of the obstruction shall be 24 inches maximum. The high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum for a reach depth of 10 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 10 inches, the high side reach shall be 46 inches maximum for a reach depth of 24 inches maximum.

5. Non-compliant position of plumbing valves located directly behind toilet seat of water closet in men's restroom.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

ADAAG Advisory 604.6 Flush Controls.

If plumbing valves are located directly behind the toilet seat, flush valves and related plumbing can cause injury or imbalance when a person leans back against them. To prevent causing injury or imbalance, the plumbing can be located behind walls or to the side of the toilet; or if approved by the local

authority having jurisdiction, provide a toilet seat lid.

6. Non-compliant existing grab bar at side wall of water closet in men's restroom does not meet minimum size requirement.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments

ADAAG 604.5.1 Side Wall.

The side wall grab bar shall be 42 inches (1065 mm) long minimum, located 12 inches (305 mm) maximum from the rear wall and extending 54 inches (1370 mm) minimum from the rear wall.

7. Inaccessible coat hook in men's restroom.
8. Non-compliant height of coat hook in men's restroom exceeds maximum height allowance.

ADAAG 604 Water Closets and Toilet Compartments.

ADAAG 604.8.3 Coat Hooks and Shelves.

Coat hooks shall be located within one of the reach ranges specified in 308.

ADAAG 308.2 Forward Reach. ADAAG 308.2.1 Unobstructed.

Where a forward reach is unobstructed, the high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low forward reach shall be 15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.2.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a high forward reach is over an obstruction, the clear floor space shall extend beneath the element for a distance not less than the required reach depth over the obstruction. The high forward reach shall be 48 inches maximum where the reach depth is 20 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 20 inches, the high forward reach shall be 44 inches maximum and the reach depth shall be 25 inches maximum.

ADAAG 308.3 Side Reach. ADAAG 308.3.1 Unobstructed.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the side reach is unobstructed, the high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum and the low side reach shall be

15 inches minimum above the finish floor or ground.

ADAAG 308.3.2 Obstructed High Reach.

Where a clear floor or ground space allows a parallel approach to an element and the high side reach is over an obstruction, the height of the obstruction shall be 34 inches maximum and the depth of the obstruction shall be 24 inches maximum. The high side reach shall be 48 inches maximum for a reach depth of 10 inches maximum. Where the reach depth exceeds 10 inches, the high side reach shall be 46 inches maximum for a reach depth of 24 inches maximum.

17. The above listing may not include all the barriers countered by Plaintiff and/or which exist at the facility. Plaintiff requires an inspection of the facility to determine **all the** ADA violations.

18. The removal of the ADA violations set forth herein is readily achievable and can be accomplished and carried out without much difficulty or expense. 42 U.S.C. § 12182(B)(2)(A)(iv); 42 U.S.C. § 12181(9); 28 C.F.R., § 36.304.

19. Plaintiff is without adequate remedy at law and is suffering irreparable harm, and reasonably anticipates that he will continue to suffer irreparable harm unless and until Defendants are required to remove the physical barriers, dangerous conditions and ADA violations that exist at the facility, including those set forth herein.

20. The Plaintiff has been obligated to retain undersigned counsel for the filing and prosecution of this action. The Plaintiff is entitled to have his reasonable attorney's fees, costs and expenses paid by the Defendants, pursuant to 42 U.S.C., §§ 12205 and 12217.

21. Pursuant to 42 U.S.C. §12188(a), this Court is provided with authority to grant injunctive relief to Plaintiff, including an order to alter the subject facility to make it readily accessible to and useable by individuals with disabilities to the extent required by the ADA, and closing the subject facility until the requisite modifications are completed.

WHEREFORE, Plaintiff respectfully requests that the Court issue a permanent injunction enjoining Defendants from continuing their discriminatory practices, ordering Defendants to remove the physical barriers to access and alter the subject Facility to make it readily accessible and useable by individuals with disabilities to the extent required by the ADA, closing the subject Facility until the barriers are removed and requisite alterations are completed,

and awarding Plaintiff his reasonable attorney's fees, expert fees, costs and litigation expenses incurred in this action.

Dated: October 6, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Jennifer E. Tucek

Law Office of Jennifer Tucek, PC

Attorney for Plaintiff

Bar No. JT2817

315 Madison Avenue, #3054

New York, N.Y. 10017

(917) 669-6991

TucekLaw@Gmail.com